

NORTHLAND REGIONAL COUNCIL

Agenda

Representation Review 2018 Initial Proposal Hearings
to be held in the Council Chambers, 36 Water Street, Whāngārei
on Tuesday 31 July 2018 commencing at 9.30am

OPEN MEETING

Item

- 1.0 Apologies
- 2.0 Declarations of Conflicts of Interest
- 3.0 Hearing of Submissions – Representation Review 2018 Initial Proposal
(refer to submissions book **attached**)
- 4.0 Close of Meeting

Representation Review 2018 Initial Proposal – Submissions

Northland Regional Council

Representation Review 2018 Initial Proposal

Submissions

Submitter	Received by	Details	To be heard?
Richard Gardner	Online through Website	Support - The review is "fine tuning", to take into account population changes in the constituencies. The changes proposed make sense, and have the support of Federated Farmers.	No
Joe Carr	Email	Refer to Attachment One (Page 3)	Yes
Te Tiriti O Waitangi Māori Committee – Ms Merehora Taurua	Email	Refer to Attachment Two (Page 6)	Yes
Wendy Howard	Website	Oppose - it is ridiculous that the Oneriri Peninsular in Kaiwaka is cut off from the rest of the town/area to which it is physically connected, and placed in a different constituency. The people who live there identify with Kaiwaka, not with Maungaturoto and other towns to their north across the water. You cannot get to Oneriri from Maungaturoto - both in the Kaipara constituency - over land without passing through the Coastal South constituency. Please adjust the boundaries so the people of Kaiwaka are not split into two when it comes to NRC matters. Alternative - The Oneriri Peninsular is added to the Coastal South constituency.	No
Margaret Hicks	Hardcopy	Refer to Attachment Three (Page 10)	Yes

Submission to Northland Regional Council

On the matter of the NRC Representation Review 2018 "Initial Proposal"

Submitter Joe Carr <joe.kate.carr@gmail.com>
Constituency Hokianga/Kaikohē

I object to the proposal which I consider is at odds with a key intention of the Northland Regional Council Representation Review that transformed the existing Council constituency boundaries in 2012. That intent was to diminish the Whangarei centrality of the previous arrangement and allow more influence from the communities of interest that, as far as possible (taking into account the requirements of the Electoral Act), determined the new 'ward' boundaries.

I submit that the status quo constituency boundary alignments still meet the key principles that determine effective and fair representation of the community to Northland Regional Council.

The principle reason for the changes advanced by Northland Regional Council in the 2018 Initial Proposal (IP2018) is the estimated population increase of the NRC Coastal South constituency (noting empirical Census data is not available yet). I suggest this 'estimated' change is an inadequate reason for the changes proposed.

As shown on Table 1 of the IP2018 all other constituencies apart from Hokianga-Kaikohē and Coastal South fit the +/- 10% rule for the estimated constituency populations. IP2018 does not include any proposal to change the boundaries of the Hokianga-Kaikohē constituency. The concluding reason given by Council in the IP2018 (page 8) for preserving the status quo of the Hokianga Kaikohē constituency is that "Extending boundaries to comply with the +/- 10% rule would amalgamate more communities of interest with little in common". This persuasive principal, to which I ascribe, is also the reason for my grave concerns about Council's intention to fiddle with the Coastal North constituency boundaries and flood that constituency with citizens who relate entirely to and with Whangarei City.

Communities of Interest. The Coastal South Constituency has in Kaiwaka and Mangawhai, a very distinct community of interest whose major issues are intrinsically linked to their Territorial Local Authority, the Kaipara District Council.

It would appear that in Council's quest to be consistent with the +/- 10% rule, the Northland Regional Council has avoided the most obvious solution - that is the re-establishment of Kaiwaka and Mangawhai into the Kaipara constituency. I note that the IP2018 consultation document confirms that the Kaipara constituency has the lowest conforming population per councillor in either the current or the IP2018's proposed 2018 structure. (Refer Table 1, IP2018 page 6 and Table 2 IP2018 page 8). That is, Kaipara, of all complying NRC constituencies appear best able to absorb the estimated increase in population to address the hypothetical problem. Further, if necessary to maintain ratios, some of the 'expanded' Kaipara constituency in its north-east, close to Whangarei, could be shed off to the adjoining Coastal South constituency.

A proposed Gerrymander?

My concern that the proposed changes to the Coastal North constituency are not wholesome to that community's main community of interest. That is the wider Bay of Islands - Mangonui area. My concern of an intentional gerrymander is heightened by the way Council has, in their consultation document IP2018, avoided any consideration of the disadvantages of the proposal to the large majority of Coastal North citizens who live in the wider Bay of Islands - Mangonui area.

Page 2 of the IP2018 states that:

“the proposed changes included in this proposal are:

1. Change the boundary of the Te Hiku constituency;
2. Make the Coastal south constituency smaller;
3. Change the boundary of the Whangarei Urban constituency; and
4. Change the boundary of the Coastal Central constituency.”

There is no mention of the IP2018’s proposed significant changes to the Coastal North constituency that I have outlined, nor their significant effects. Currently the Bay of Islands - Mangonui area does not have a resident councillor on Northland Regional Council and the proposed changes will considerably reduce the likelihood of this and should be resisted for this reason. This is disingenuous consultation at best.

Flawed Decision Making

I refer to page 4 of the IP2018 which lists the considerations or tests used to evaluate Effective Representation. Under these tests the proposal to transfer a large number of electors from close Whangarei Environs to the Coastal North constituency fails dismally. These new transferees from the current NRC Chairman Cr Bill Shepherd’s place of influence (near where he lives) would total over 20% of the resulting Coastal Northern constituency. Areas to transfer into Coastal North include a significant part of Whangarei City, Wharekohe, Poroti, Kokupu, Mangatapere and their surrounding communities. The true extent of this transfer is masked by pruning the top of the Coastal North constituency and transferring electors to Te Hiku, and pruning a southern part of the current Coastal North constituency and transferring those electors to Coastal Central. The irony of removing coastal dwellers from Coastal North and replacing them with a significantly greater number of Whangarei people from an area with the least possible association with coastal Northland has for some reason escaped the decision makers at NRC.

IP2018 (page 4) Factors listed for determining a Community of Interest:

- * A sense of “community identity” and affiliations between towns and settlements;
- * Similarities in demographic, socio-economic and/or ethnic characteristics;
- * River catchments and distinctive topographical features;
- * Similarities in economic or social activities carried out in the area; and
- * Shared facilities such as schools, marae, shops, and recreational facilities.

IP2018 (page 4) Factors for determining Effective Representation:

- * Would people have reasonable access to their councillors and vice versa?
- * Would councillors be able to easily attend public meetings in their constituency and provide reasonable opportunities for the people who live there to have face to face meetings?
- * Would the number of councillors, coupled with their relative constituencies, enable councillor workload to be shared appropriately?

I consider that in the above terms and actual personal performance, the Bay of Islands – Mangonui area is currently being inadequately represented.

A totally unintended consequence, if the proposed IP2018 changes to Coastal North boundaries occur, could be that current Whangarei City residents find themselves as poorly represented as Bay of Islands – Mangonui residents are currently in the event that both Coastal North NRC councillors were Bay of Islands – Mangonui residents.

I submit that the Representation Review 2018 proposals are seriously flawed and unreasonable. They are based on population estimates, not 2018 Census data and reek of gerrymander. Given these circumstances the Local Electoral Commission should be asked to support the status quo or only vary the status quo by re-establishing Mangawhai and Kaiwaka into the NRC Kaipara constituency.

Thank you for the opportunity to make this submission on matters that go to the very heart of local democracy in Northland.

Joe Carr

RD1 Okaihau

I want to speak to this submission

Representation Review 2018 – Initial Proposal Submission form



The closing date for submissions is 4pm Tuesday, 24 July 2018

Giving your feedback

We encourage online feedback, as it helps keep costs down: www.nrc.govt.nz/RepReview

Otherwise, complete this form and return it by:

- Mail: Northland Regional Council, Private Bag 9021, Whangārei Mail Centre, Whangārei 0148
- Email: submissions@nrc.govt.nz
- Delivery: to our main office at 36 Water Street, Whangārei; or to any of our regional offices

IMPORTANT NOTES:

- The questions in this feedback form are designed to be read in conjunction with the Representation Review 2018 – Initial Proposal document.
- To assist us in determining our final representation arrangements and the make-up of the constituencies, you can make a submission on:
 1. The number of constituencies;
 2. Where the boundaries should be;
 3. The names of those constituencies; and
 4. The number of councillors.
 (remembering the population criteria and ratios required by law)

Your name and contact details

Full name: Merehora Taurua

Organisation (if giving feedback on behalf): Te Tiriti O Waitangi Maori Committee

Mailing address: 25 Tahuna Road, Paihia 0200

Email: mata8288@xtra.co.nz

Phone/Mobile: 027 579 8262

Please tell us how you found out about this consultation

- ☐ Community Group
☐ Twitter / Facebook
☐ Email invite from us
☐ Letter from us

Please tell us any other ways you found out about this consultation:

Support	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> I SUPPORT the council's proposed representation arrangements for the 2019 elections because... 	<p>Please comment:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Te Tiriti O Waitangi 1840 agreed to kawanatanga by the crown (NRC being an agent of the crown) in partnership with hapu and their rangatira. Hapu did not cede sovereignty over their whenua nga taonga tuku iho. Hapu rangatira in this region signed the Maori version of Te Tiriti at in 1840. Other chiefs of other tribes signed the translated pakeha version of the Treaty giving sovereignty to the crown. As well as rangatiratanga, all the rights of British citizenship and the right of hapu to continue to develop trade with their partners are enshrined in Te Tiriti [Maori version]. Partnership is not achieved by dominance of one party over the other. The principles of Te Tiriti O Waitangi 1840 are transposed into English law within the 1962 Maori Community Development Act. It is therefore timely that the council's proposed representation in the 2019 elections be re-arranged.

Oppose																	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> I OPPOSE the council's proposed representation arrangements for the 2019 elections because... 	<p>Please comment:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The council's proposed 2019 representation arrangements do not take into account mergence with district councils and are therefore set up to fail for Maori. The principles of partnership whether enshrined in Te Tiriti O Waitangi or not must be based upon equal representation over given areas/constituencies regardless of the number of citizens therein. Any review of the pakeha boundaries under law must be synchronised with the 14 tribal boundaries gazetted by law throughout Northland/Tai Tokerau in 1947 and vice versa. The number of councillors must be consistent with the number of wards/tribal areas otherwise any "partnership" will be a failure, therefore : <table border="0"> <tr> <td><u>Council arrangements :</u></td><td><u>Gazetted Tribal Boundaries :</u></td></tr> <tr> <td>Te Hiku</td><td>Te Aupouri, Te Rarawa and Ngati Kahu.</td></tr> <tr> <td>Hokianga-Kaikohe</td><td>Western, Northern & South Hokianga and Western Kaikohe</td></tr> <tr> <td>Coastal North</td><td>Whangaroa, Eastern Kaikohe and Kawakawa</td></tr> <tr> <td>Whangārei Urban</td><td>Whangarei and Mangakahia</td></tr> <tr> <td>Coastal Central</td><td>Whangarei</td></tr> <tr> <td>Coastal South</td><td>Whangarei</td></tr> <tr> <td>Kaipara</td><td>Hobson, Otamatea, Kaipara.</td></tr> </table> Te Hiku is customarily Muriwhenua and therefore tribally affiliated. Hokianga-Kaikohe are mixed inland and coastal hapu - not tikanga. Hokianga coastal hapu maintain their own mana. Taiamai Waimate Kaikohe inland hapu maintain their own mana Coastal North over-rides Whangaroa. Whangaroa hapu maintained their own mana since Hongi Hika. Coastal North without Whangaroa is tribally affiliated as Te Peiwhairangi. Whangarei Urban includes inland Mangakahia and should also include Kawakawa Ngati Hine inland hapu. Coastal Central and Coastal South hapu are tribally affiliated. 	<u>Council arrangements :</u>	<u>Gazetted Tribal Boundaries :</u>	Te Hiku	Te Aupouri, Te Rarawa and Ngati Kahu.	Hokianga-Kaikohe	Western, Northern & South Hokianga and Western Kaikohe	Coastal North	Whangaroa, Eastern Kaikohe and Kawakawa	Whangārei Urban	Whangarei and Mangakahia	Coastal Central	Whangarei	Coastal South	Whangarei	Kaipara	Hobson, Otamatea, Kaipara.
<u>Council arrangements :</u>	<u>Gazetted Tribal Boundaries :</u>																
Te Hiku	Te Aupouri, Te Rarawa and Ngati Kahu.																
Hokianga-Kaikohe	Western, Northern & South Hokianga and Western Kaikohe																
Coastal North	Whangaroa, Eastern Kaikohe and Kawakawa																
Whangārei Urban	Whangarei and Mangakahia																
Coastal Central	Whangarei																
Coastal South	Whangarei																
Kaipara	Hobson, Otamatea, Kaipara.																


	<p>15. Kaipara hapu are tribally affiliated.</p> <p>16. Mahurangi hapu are left out of the council's proposed representation arrangements.</p>
--	--

Alternative	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> As an ALTERNATIVE, I propose... 	<p>Please comment:</p> <p>THAT the Local Electoral Act 2001 be amended to recognise the fourteen [14] 1947 gazetted tribal areas of Te Tai Tokerau; THAT the Northland regional council subsumes the Whangarei District, the Whangarei City and the Far North District Councils under the Act; and THAT the Northland regional council be comprised of 14 councillors, one for each of its [combined] 14 wards.</p>

Hearings
<p>You are welcome to speak to the hearings panel at a Hearings meeting about your submission. The Hearings meeting is scheduled for 31 July – 1 August 2018. Please indicate if you wish to present your submission in person to the hearing panel:</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes, I do wish to be heard in support of my submission</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> No, I do not wish to be heard in support of my submission</p>

For more information on any of the questions above, please see our Representation Review 2018 – Initial Proposal document and other useful documents at www.nrc.govt/RepReview

If you have more to say, feel free to attach more pages to this feedback form.

Your signature
<p><i>You don't need to sign this submission form if sent electronically.</i></p> <p>Signature:  Date: 23rd June 2018</p> <p>Merehora Taurua</p>

Privacy statement:

Please be aware when providing personal information that all submissions are part of a public

consultation process. As such, information provided will be made publicly available, including submitters' names and addresses.

attn
 Malcolm Nicholson
 CEO.
 Northland Regional Council
 Water Street
 WHANGAREI.

P.O. Box 224.
 Ruakaka 0161.
 Tel. no 09 432 7117



July 9th 2018.

Dear Malcolm Nicholson.

Re representation review 2018.

Whereas I do agree that it may be necessary to re-align some of the boundaries of the Northland regions constituencies, I do not agree with that proposed for my own region Coastal South. Quite the contrary I submit that it should be the southernmost areas of Rangahai and Kawaka that should be omitted and transferred to Kaipara for the following reasons:-

- 1/ Rangahai and Kawaka are not in the same geographical areas of Bream Bay and Whangarei Harbour. They are in fact more closely linked to Rodney and therefore should be included within Kaipara.
- 2/ They are not within the same district council area of Whangarei as are Bream Bay and the Whangarei Harbour but are part of Kaipara.
- 3/ Socially Rangahai has significant absentee

2.

property ownership from Auckland. These only reside in the area periodically and therefore do not have the same community involvement as permanent residents. Their priorities are largely more self centred.

4) Hangaohai and Kawaka are not in the role of Palukarakele but in that of Te Uri A Hau which appears to have a differing agenda and interests, a possible source of disagreement.

5) Hangaohai and Kawaka are not even included in the Northland telephone directory and are toll calls for those of us living in the rest of the Coastal South constituencies as well as urban Waikaraka etc.

It is quite obvious that Hangaohai and Kawaka do not fit in with the rest of Coastal South and so it is these areas which should be transferred not the northern portion of the constituencies.

It is difficult to understand how Hangaohai and Kawaka came to be included in the first place considering the obvious differences geographically, administratively, socially and maori affiliations.

Yours faithfully,
Harold B. Davis